

## NOTICE OF MEETING

# TENDERS SUBCOMMITTEE

I hereby give notice that an Ordinary Meeting of the Tenders Subcommittee will be held on:-

**DATE:**        **Friday**                    **29 November 2002**                    **TIME:**        **9.00 am**

**VENUE:**        **Civic Centre, 6 Waipareira Avenue, Lincoln, Waitakere City**

to consider the business as set out herein and to take any necessary action connected therewith.



25 November 2002

Sharon Simiona  
**COMMITTEE SECRETARY**

Telephone (09) 836 8000 extn 8820

### **MEMBERSHIP:**

Councillors    JM    Clews, QSO, JP (Chairperson)  
                  GB    Presland (Deputy Chairperson)

Chief Executive

Director: City Services

Director: Corporate & Civic Services

Director: Strategy & Development

Director: Finance

Maori Issues Manager

Mayor, Bob Harvey, QSO, JP (ex officio)

Deputy Mayor, CA Stone (ex officio)

(Quorum 4 members)

★ ★ ★ ★ ★ ★ ★ ★ ★ ★

(The reports and recommendations contained in all agendas are reports and recommendations only and are not to be construed, in any way, as Council policy until adopted.)

**AGENDA FOR AN ORDINARY MEETING OF THE TENDERS SUBCOMMITTEE  
TO BE HELD IN THE CIVIC CENTRE, 6 WAIPAREIRA AVENUE, LINCOLN,  
WAITAKERE CITY, ON FRIDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2002,  
COMMENCING AT 9.00 AM.**

---

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

<b><u>ITEM</u></b>		<b><u>PAGE NO.</u></b>
1	<b>APOLOGIES</b>	<b>1</b>
2	<b>URGENT BUSINESS</b>	<b>1</b>
3	<b>CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES</b>	<b>1</b>
4	<b>CONTRACT NO. PK02512B – CAR PARK UPGRADING AT MOIRE AND OLYMPIC PARKS</b>	<b>2</b>
5	<b>CONTRACT NO. EW 02 607C - WATERMAIN RENEWALS - GREAT NORTH ROAD/ TE ATATU ROAD</b>	<b>4</b>
6	<b>CONTRACT NO. EW 02 631C - 2002/2003 SEWER UPGRADE KOTUKU STREET /TE ATATU ROAD</b>	<b>7</b>
7	<b>CONTRACT NO. EW 02 643C - KOREAN CHURCH CAR PARK STORMWATER QUALITY PROJECT</b>	<b>10</b>
8	<b>CONTRACT NO. EW02 646C - WILLERTON AVENUE, AIRDRIE ROAD AND RANUI STATION ROAD STORMWATER PROJECT</b>	<b>13</b>

**AGENDA FOR AN ORDINARY MEETING OF THE TENDERS SUBCOMMITTEE  
TO BE HELD IN THE CIVIC CENTRE, 6 WAIPAREIRA AVENUE, LINCOLN,  
WAITAKERE CITY, ON FRIDAY, 29 NOVEMBER 2002,  
COMMENCING AT 9.00 AM.**

---

**1 APOLOGIES**



**2 URGENT BUSINESS**

Section 46A(7) and (7A) of the Local Government Official Information Act and Meetings Act 1987 provides that where an item of business is not on the agenda, it may only be dealt with at the meeting if:

- (i) the item is a minor matter; and
- (ii) the Chairperson has explained at the beginning of the meeting (when open to the public) that the item will be raised for discussion, why the item is not on the agenda, and why it cannot be delayed until a subsequent meeting; and
- (iii) the Committee resolves to deal with the item.

No resolution, decision, or recommendation may be made in respect of the item except to refer the item to a subsequent meeting for further discussion.

**NOTE:** Urgent Business need not be dealt with now and may be delayed until later in the meeting.



**3 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES**

Ordinary - 15 November 2002

**RECOMMENDATION**

That the minutes of the Ordinary Meeting of the Tenders Subcommittee held on Friday, 15 November 2002, as circulated, be taken as read and now be confirmed.



4 **CONTRACT NO. PK02512B – CAR PARK UPGRADING AT MOIRE AND OLYMPIC PARKS**

**PURPOSE OF THE REPORT**

The purpose of this report is to seek approval from the Tenders Subcommittee to award Contract No PK02512B Car park Upgrade at Moire and Olympic Parks.

**BACKGROUND**

This contract is for the upgrading of an existing car park at Moire Park and the construction of a new car park at Olympic Park. Both designs have been prepared after extensive consultation with users and surrounding residents and form part of the Parks management plans.

The works are to be provided due to an increase in demand at both sites. Additional parking to be provided is 55 and 24 spaces respectively at Moire and Olympic Parks.

**SCOPE OF WORK**

The construction of the two car parks is generally the same with both surfaces constructed from asphaltic concrete.

Both sites incorporate devices and / or designs to enhance the quality of stormwater run off prior to it entering the public stormwater system.

Provision has also been made to accommodate parking spaces for the disabled.

Physical works include earthworks, drainage, pavement construction, retaining walls and kerb/ channel.

**TENDERS RECEIVED**

Tenders were publicly advertised with six sets of documents being uplifted. The tenders received all exceeded the engineers estimate and the available budget, therefore all tenders were rejected. The tenderers were subsequently invited to submit a revised tender based on a reduced scope of works. All three tenders re priced the works and were received by the closing date of 7 November 4pm. These are summarised in Table 1 below:

<b>TENDERER</b>	<b>REG OFFICE</b>	<b>TENDER PRICE (excl. GST)</b>
Nasey Contractors Limited	6 Tait Place, Albany	\$232,361.00
Auckland Civil Limited	P.O.Box 100 441, NSMC	\$255,321.50
Arrow Civil	P.O.Box 13116, Onehunga	\$284,806.00
<b>Pre-tender contract estimate</b>		<b>\$230,000.00</b>

**Table 1 - Summary of Tender Prices**

**TENDER EVALUATION**

In accordance with the conditions of tendering, tenders were evaluated in line with the Weighted Attribute Method contained in Transfund New Zealand's "Competitive Pricing Procedures Manual".

A summary of the evaluation results is shown in Table 2:

Tender	Attributes	Exper.	Track	Tech.	Resour.	Manag.	Method.	Price	Contract Number PK02512B
			Record	Skill		Skill			
Evaluation	Weights	5	5	5	5	5	5	70	Total Weights 100
Tenderer	Tender Sum	Grades							INDEX
Nasey Contractors	\$232,361.00	75	80	75	70	80	75	59	64
Auckland Civil	\$255,321.50	80	80	75	80	80	75	50	59
Arrow Civil	\$284,806.00	75	55	70	70	70	75	38	48
<b>Median Tender Price</b>	\$255,321.50								

**Table 2 - Summary of Tender Evaluation**

Nasey Contractors Limited have completed numerous contracts for Waitakere City Council previously and these contracts have been completed to a high standard.

### **TAGS, ERRORS OR OMISSIONS**

There were no tags, tenders or omissions in any of the tenders.

### **CREDIT CHECK**

A credit check on Nasey Contractors Limited dated 8 October 2002 revealed no adverse information.

### **SUMMARY**

The results of the tender evaluation as summarised in Table 2 shows that the tender submitted by Nasey Contractors achieved the highest index of 64. This tender is also the lowest priced tender.

Nasey Contractors have successfully completed a number of projects for Waitakere City Council and are experienced and competent for a project of this size and scope.

As part of City Services vision "Quality and Health and Safety is not negotiable" all contractors have had this focus clearly reinforced through the contract documents and this will be strongly reiterated at the subsequent pre-start meeting and imposed during the contract period.

### **JOB COSTS**

	<u>EXCL. GST</u>
Tender sum - Nasey Contractors Limited	\$232,361.00
Contingency	\$ 17,639.00
Engineering & Supervision	\$ 24,500.00
Other PM Fees and Consent Fees	\$ 15,500.00
<b>Total Job Cost</b>	<b>\$290,000.00</b>

## SOURCE OF FUNDING

Budget Description (from Annual Budget line item)	Codes	Budget	Committed to Other Projects	Allocation to This Project	Unallocate d Balance
Moire Park Car park Development Athletics and Main Car park Link	75 9825 46250	\$185,000	\$0.00	\$ 185,000	\$0.00
Olympic Park Overflow Car park & Landscaping	75 9825 39500	\$105,000	\$0.00	\$ 105,000	\$0.00
Total		\$290,000	\$0.00	\$ 290,000	\$0.00

## RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That the information be received
2. That the tender from Nasey Contractors for Contract No. PK02512B - Car park Upgrade at Moire and Olympic Parks in the sum of \$232,361.00 plus \$29,045.13 GST, totalling \$261,406.13 be accepted.
3. That authority to enter into Contract No. PK02512B - Car Park Upgrade at Moire and Olympic Parks on behalf of the Council be delegated to the Director: City Services.

Report prepared by: Alan Duxfield, Parks Project Manager: Environmental.



## 5 CONTRACT NO. EW 02 607C - WATERMAIN RENEWALS - GREAT NORTH ROAD/ TE ATATU ROAD

### PURPOSE OF THE REPORT

The purpose of this report is to seek approval from the Tenders Subcommittee to award Contract No. EW 02 607C - Watermain Renewals - Great North Road/ Te Atatu Road.

### BACKGROUND

The proposed renewal work is required to replace the existing watermain which has been leaking. There has been the need for several expensive repairs on joints recently and additional repairs would have been necessary in order to maintain the service levels. This work has been provided for in the 2002/2003 Annual Plan.

### SCOPE OF WORK

The Contract Works comprise the construction of about 365 metres of 300 mm nominal diameter Ductile Iron pipe, together with associated valves and fittings, by open cut methodology at Great North Road/ Te Atatu Road in Waitakere City.

## TENDERS RECEIVED

Tenders were invited from all the 14 contractors pre-qualified to tender for the construction of watermain projects in EcoWater's 2002/2003 works programme. Three (3) tenders were received by the closing date of 5 November 2002.

These are summarised in Table 1 below:

TENDERER	REG OFFICE	TENDER PRICE (excl. GST)
Stockman General Contractors Limited	Clevedon	\$169,755.00
JB Pipeline Services Limited	Onehunga	\$173,371.00
Excell Corporation Limited	Greenmount	\$210,767.00
<b>Pre-tender contract estimate</b>		\$154,000.00

**Table 1 - Summary of Tender Prices**

## TENDER EVALUATION

In accordance with the conditions of tendering, tenders were evaluated in line with the Lowest Price Conforming Tender Method contained in Transfund New Zealand's "Competitive Pricing Procedures Manual".

This procedure requires a two-stage process. In the first stage tenders are ranked in ascending order based on prices. The second stage consists of determining tender acceptability when assessed against each of the non-price attributes and no others, with each attribute being scored on a pass/fail basis. Any attribute that scores a fail excludes that tender from further consideration. The determination of acceptability commences with the lowest priced tender and ceases when the first conforming tender is determined.

Stockman General Contractors Limited submitted the lowest tender price. The tender documents required the invited tenderers to submit non-price attribute information on Technical Skills and Methodology only, as all are considered to have already passed in the other non-price attributes through the previous prequalification process. The tender of Stockman General Contractors Limited has been scored a "pass" in each of the remaining two attributes.

Tenderer	Tender Price	Relevant Experience	Track Record	Resor.	Management Skills	Tech. Skills	Method	Lowest Price Conforming Tender
Stockman General Contractors Limited	\$169,755.00	Pre-Qualified	Pre-Qualified	Pre-Qualified	Pre-Qualified	Pass	Pass	Yes
JB Pipeline Services Limited	\$173,371.00							
Excell Corporation Limited	\$210,767.00							

**Table 2 - Summary of Tender Evaluation**

## TAGS, ERRORS OR OMISSIONS

There were no tags, errors or omissions in the tender submitted by Stockman General Contractors Limited.

## CREDIT CHECK

A credit check dated 7 November 2002 on Stockman General Contractors Limited did not show any adverse results.

## SUMMARY

The Lowest Priced Conforming Tender was submitted by Stockman General Contractors Limited. This tender has achieved a pass in all the non-price attributes and therefore is recommended for award.

As part of City Services vision "Quality and Health and Safety is not negotiable" all contractors have had this focus clearly reinforced through the contract documents and this will be strongly reiterated at the subsequent pre-start meeting and imposed during the contract period.

## JOB COSTS

	<u>EXCL. GST</u>
Tender Sum - Stockman General Contractors Limited	\$169,755.00
Contingency	\$ 16,975.00
Engineering & Supervision	\$ 11,520.00
	-----
Total Job Cost	<u>\$198,250.00</u>

## SOURCE OF FUNDING

Budget description (from Annual Plan line item)	Project SFL Code	Budget Amount	Committed to other projects	Allocation to this project	Unallocated balance
Watermain Renewal	85-9855-60000-999	\$1,876,000	\$1,072,891	\$198,250	\$604,859

## RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That the information be received.
2. That the tender from Stockman General Contractors Limited for Contract No. EW 02 607C - Watermain Renewals - Great North Road/Te Atatu Road, in the sum of \$169,755.00 plus \$21,219.38 GST, totalling \$190,974.38 be accepted.
3. That authority to enter into Contract No. EW02 607C - Watermain Renewals - Great North Road/Te Atatu Road on behalf of Council be delegated to the Manager, EcoWater Solutions.

Report prepared by: Tony Miguel, Manager, EcoWater Solutions.



6 **CONTRACT NO. EW 02 631C - 2002/2003 SEWER UPGRADE KOTUKU STREET  
/TE ATATU ROAD**

**PURPOSE OF THE REPORT**

The purpose of this report is to seek approval from the Tenders Subcommittee to award Contract No. EW 02 631C - 2002/2003 Sewer Upgrade Kotuku Street/Te Atatu Road.

**BACKGROUND**

The catchment serviced by the drains to be upgraded has experienced significant infill housing development over recent years and the existing drains are under capacity for the current level of development.

**SCOPE OF WORK**

The works to be carried out under this contract include:

- The replacement of approximately 300 m of existing 225 mm diameter wastewater drain using a combination of open cut and pipe bursting construction techniques;
- The construction of a new manhole.

**TENDERS RECEIVED**

Tenders were publicly advertised with five (5) sets of documents being uplifted. Four (4) tenders were received by the closing date of 22 October 2002. These are summarised in Table 1 below:

<b>TENDERER</b>	<b>REG OFFICE</b>	<b>TENDER PRICE (excl. GST)</b>
H & H Contractors Limited	New Lynn	\$84,180.00
JB Pipeline Services Limited	Onehunga	\$99,450.00
PipeWorks Rehabilitation Solutions Limited	Mt Wellington	\$117,633.00
Pipe Bursting Services Limited	Silverdale	\$119,210.00
<b>Pre-tender contract estimate</b>		\$111,949.00

**Table 1 - Summary of Tender Prices**

**TENDER EVALUATION**

In accordance with the conditions of tendering, tenders were evaluated in line with the Weighted Attribute Method contained in Transfund New Zealand's "Competitive Pricing Procedures Manual".

These procedures require that where the tender includes Provisional Sums (work valued by the Principal and placed within the Schedule of Prices) they are deducted from the Tender Sum prior to evaluating each tender.

In this contract the value of Provisional Sums is \$2,000.00.

A summary of the evaluation results is shown in Table 2:

Tender Evaluation	Attributes	Experience	Track	Technical	Resources	Management	Methodology	Price	Contract Number EW02631C
			Record	Skill		Skill			Total Weights
	Weights	10	5	5	5	10	15	50	100
Tenderer	Tender Sum	Grades							INDEX
H & H Contractors Ltd	\$82,180.00	60	40	50	60	40	60	73	63
JB Pipeline Services Ltd	\$97,450.00	70	70	65	65	65	75	59	64
PipeWorks Rehabilitation Solutions Ltd	\$115,633.00	75	75	75	70	70	70	41	57
Pipe Bursting Services Ltd	\$117,210.00	75	70	70	70	70	75	40	56
<b>Median Tender Price</b>	\$106,541.50								

**Table 2 - Summary of Tender Evaluation**

H & H Contractors Limited has received low scores for the “track record” and “management skills” attributes. This is due to their performance on recent contracts with Waitakere City Council.

The attribute scores given to JB Pipeline Services Limited reflect the information submitted in the tender, experience from previous works undertaken for Council, and discussions with referees. However, although JB Pipeline Services Limited has the necessary expertise, technical skills and resources to undertake the work, it has been Council’s experience that JB Pipeline Services Limited requires additional construction supervision during construction in order to achieve the desired outcome.

**TAGS, ERRORS OR OMISSIONS**

There were no tags, errors or omissions in the tenders from H & H Contractor’s Limited, JB Pipeline Services Limited and Pipe Bursting Services Limited.

PipeWorks Rehabilitation Solutions Limited submitted two tags with their tender. These have not been considered any further since the resolution of these tags will not affect the outcome of the tender evaluation due to the amount of the tender price.

**CREDIT CHECK**

A credit check dated 14 August 2002, carried out on JB Pipeline Services Limited revealed no adverse information.

**SUMMARY**

The results of the tender evaluation as summarised in Table 2 show that the tender submitted by JB Pipeline Services Limited achieved the highest overall index of 64. This tender is the second lowest priced tender amongst the tenders received.

It is considered that JB Pipeline Services Limited has the expertise, technical skills and resources to carry out the works. However, in order to ensure a satisfactory outcome to the construction work, additional supervision cost will need to be provided for, although the amount required will be small because the contract works are relatively straightforward.

As part of City Services vision “Quality and Health and Safety is not negotiable” all contractors have had this focus clearly reinforced through the contract documents and this will be strongly reiterated at the subsequent pre-start meeting and imposed during the contract period.

**JOB COSTS**

	<b>Excl. GST</b>
Tender sum - JB Pipeline Services Limited	\$ 99,450.00
Contingency	\$ 9,950.00
Engineering & Supervision	\$ 9,450.00
Additional Supervision	\$ 1,800.00
	-----
Total Job Cost	\$120,650.00

**SOURCE OF FUNDING**

Budget Description (from Annual Budget line item)	Codes	Budget	Committed to Other Projects	Allocation to This Project	Unallocated Balance
Wastewater Upgrades	85-9821-60000-999	\$2,151,400	\$319,582	\$120,650.00	\$1,711,168

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

1. That the information be received.
2. That the tender from JB Pipeline Services Limited for Contract No. EW 02 631C - 2002/2003 Sewer Upgrade Kotuku St/Te Atatu Road in the sum of \$99,450.00 plus \$12,431.25 GST, totalling \$111,881.25 be accepted.
3. That the tender for Contract No. EW 02 631C - 2002/2003 Sewer Upgrade Kotuku St/Te Atatu Road be awarded to other than the lowest priced tender, because the weighted attributes tender evaluation method requires the tendering authority to enter into a contract only with the tender that scores the highest overall index.
4. That the Manager, EcoWater Solutions be delegated the authority to enter into this contract on behalf of the Council.

Report prepared by: Tony Miguel, Manager, EcoWater Solutions.



**7 CONTRACT NO. EW 02 643C - KOREAN CHURCH CAR PARK STORMWATER QUALITY PROJECT**

**PURPOSE OF THE REPORT**

The purpose of this report is to seek approval from the Tenders Subcommittee to award Contract No. EW 02 643C - Korean Church Car Park Stormwater Quality Project.

**BACKGROUND**

The treatment of stormwater runoff from the main car parks of Henderson prior to discharge into Opanuku or Oratia Streams is part of the overall strategy for the Henderson Creek catchment. This strategy is well received by Infrastructure Auckland who has contributed toward this project.

**SCOPE OF WORK**

The scope of work includes the supply and installation of a system of two sand filter units and the associated collection pipes. The sand filter system includes the internal pipe systems and inlet and outlet chambers.

**TENDERS RECEIVED**

Tenders were publicly advertised with nine sets of documents being uplifted. Six conforming tenders and one alternative tender were received by the closing date of 29 October 2002. These are summarised in Table 1 below:

<b>TENDERER</b>	<b>REG OFFICE</b>	<b>TENDER PRICE (excl. GST)</b>
Stonedale Civil Contractors Ltd (Alternative Tender)	358 Geiling Road, Hunua	146,630.00
Stonedale Civil Contractors Ltd	358 Geiling Road, Hunua	162, 100.00
Techscape Limited	Private Bag 302909, North Shore	168,606.04
Civil Construction Group Ltd	PO Box 46009, Herne Bay	173,677.90
H & H Contractors Ltd	12A Culperry Road, Glendene	181,138.00
Fibretek Ltd	PO Box 251 149, Pakuranga	Not Opened
Counce Consultants NZ Ltd	722 Mt. Eden Road, Mt Eden	Not Opened
<b>Pre-tender contract estimate</b>		190,308.00

**Table 1 - Summary of Tender Prices**

**TENDER EVALUATION**

In accordance with the conditions of tendering, tenders were evaluated in line with the Weighted Attribute Method contained in Transfund New Zealand's "Competitive Pricing Procedures Manual".

The "Two envelope process" as described in Section 2.7 of the above manual was followed. Under this method, only the first tender envelope is opened and the non-price attributes evaluated for all tenders before the second envelope containing the tender price is opened, and the tender prices duly included in the evaluation.

Scores for the non-price attributes were determined on the basis of information provided in the tender and on recent experience with the contractors.

The tender received from Fibretek Limited did not provide any information on Methodology, and the submission for Experience did not provide any information that was relevant to the proposed works. Therefore, they were scored 0 and 35, respectively, for the Methodology and Experience attributes, which constitute a “fail” for both. Consequently, their tender is excluded from further consideration.

The tender from Counce Consultants NZ Limited also did not provide any information on the firm’s Experience that was relevant to the proposed works. Furthermore, Counce Consultants NZ Limited’s recent track record with Council has not been favourable. Therefore, they were scored 35 for Experience and 40 for Track Record. The 35 score for Experience constitutes a “fail”, and so their tender is excluded from further consideration.

A summary of the evaluation results is shown in Table 2:

Tender Evaluation	Attributes	Exper.	Track Record	Tech. Skill	Resour.	Manag. Skill	Method.	Price	Contract No. EW 02 643C
		Weights	5	5	5	5	5	5	70
Tenderer	Tender Sum	Grades							INDEX
Stonedale Civil Contractors Ltd	\$162,100.00	60	50	65	55	60	50	55	56
Techscape Limited	\$168,606.04	45	40	55	50	55	45	51	51
Civil Construction Group Ltd	\$173,677.90	60	50	60	55	55	50	49	50
H & H Contractors Ltd	\$181,138.00	50	40	50	55	40	45	44	45
Fibretek Ltd	Disqualified	35	40	45	40	50	0		Disqualified
Counce Consultants NZ Ltd	Disqualified	35	40	45	40	40	45		Disqualified
<b>Median Tender Price</b>	\$171,141.97								

**Table 2 - Summary of Tender Evaluation**

Stonedale Civil Contractors Limited carried out similar works for EcoWater last year, during which time they demonstrated that they have the necessary skills and resources to carry out the works satisfactorily. Therefore, their non-price attributes have been scored accordingly.

The alternative tender submitted by Stonedale Civil Contractors Limited proposes to install the Sand Filter Unit in the grass area away from the paved parking area. Although this proposal has a possible cost saving of approximately \$15,000.00, it is not acceptable because the proposed location of the sand filter unit encroaches into the ground of Korean Church. This is not desirable, as the design location of the sand filter is on Council property in order that routine maintenance can be readily carried out.

Techscape Limited have proposed in their tender to have all of the construction work carried by subcontractors. Consequently, the non-price attribute information for both Techscape Limited and their subcontractors have been jointly considered when determining the non-price attribute scores, with more weighting being given towards the attribute of the party to which it has more relevance. The Techscape Limited tender assessment reflects this arrangement

## TAGS, ERRORS OR OMISSIONS

There were no tags, errors or omissions in any of the tenders received.

## CREDIT CHECK

A credit check dated 12 November 2002 on Stonedale Civil Contractors Limited revealed no adverse information.

## SUMMARY

The results of the tender evaluation as summarised in Table 2 show that the tender submitted by Stonedale Civil Contractors Limited achieved the highest overall index of 56. This tender is also the lowest priced conforming tender. It is considered that Stonedale Civil Contractors Limited have the necessary experience and resources to complete the contract satisfactorily.

As part of City Services vision "Quality and Health and Safety is not negotiable" all contractors have had this focus clearly reinforced through the contract documents and this will be strongly reiterated at the subsequent pre-start meeting and imposed during the contract period.

## JOB COSTS

	<u>EXCL. GST</u>
Tender sum - Stonedale Civil Contractors Limited	\$162,100.00
Contingency	\$ 16,210.00
Engineering & Supervision	\$ 9,300.00
	-----
Total Job Cost	\$187,610.00

## SOURCE OF FUNDING

Budget Description (from Annual Budget line item)	Codes	Budget	Committed to Other Projects	Allocation to this Project	Unallocated Balance
Stormwater Upgrades	85-9815-60000-999	\$6,635,000	\$764,439	\$187,610	\$5,682,951

## RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That the information be received.
2. That the tender from Stonedale Civil Contractors Limited for Contract No. EW 02 643C - Korean Church Car Park Stormwater Quality Project in the sum of \$162,100.00 plus \$20,262.50 GST, totalling \$182,362.50 be accepted.
3. That authority to enter into Contract No. EW 02 643C - Korean Church Car Park Stormwater Quality Project on behalf of Council be delegated to the Manager, EcoWater Solutions.

Report prepared by: Tony Miguel, Manager, EcoWater Solutions.



8 **CONTRACT NO. EW02 646C - WILLERTON AVENUE, AIRDRIE ROAD AND RANUI STATION ROAD STORMWATER PROJECT**

**PURPOSE OF THE REPORT**

The purpose of this report is to seek approval from the Tenders Subcommittee to award Contract No. EW02 646C - Willerton Avenue, Airdrie Road and Ranui Station Road Stormwater Project.

**BACKGROUND**

The contract consists of three projects each making up a separable portion.

**Willerton Avenue**

An existing 225 mm diameter stormwater system is located at the rear of No. 92 Titirangi Road. This system discharges to an open drain on the property boundary of Nos. 3 and 5 Willerton Avenue. This open drain is collected by a PVC pipe saddled into an existing 300 mm diameter stormwater drain.

The existing stormwater system downstream has been CCTV surveyed and was found to be in poor condition.

**Airdrie Road**

The property at No. 55 Airdrie Road experiences surface flooding due to an inadequate stormwater system. At present the existing upstream catchment and the Airdrie Road drainage discharges to an open drain. This open drain is located on the southern side of No. 55 Airdrie Road.

**Ranui Station Road**

Flooding problems have been occurring in the low lying areas at the rear of No. 13 Ranui Station Road and Nos. 10 - 14 Arney Road. There is no stormwater reticulation in the area and properties use soakage as their means of stormwater disposal.

**SCOPE OF WORK**

**Willerton Avenue**

A new manhole is to be installed within No. 92 Titirangi Road. This manhole will be placed on the existing 225 mm diameter stormwater pipeline that currently discharges to the open drain within No. 3 Willerton Avenue. The flow will be redirected to an existing manhole within No. 90 Titirangi Road via a new 225 mm diameter stormwater pipeline. The total length of pipeline is 50 meters with pipe sizes of 225 mm and 300 mm diameter.

**Airdrie Road**

A new stormwater pipeline will be installed to replace the existing open drain along the southern boundary of No. 55 Airdrie Road. New inlets will be provided for the table drains. The pipe size is 300 mm diameter with a length of 75 meters. The existing open drain will be backfilled on completion of the works and the area reinstated.

**Ranui Station Road**

Two cesspits are to be installed at the low points within Nos. 12 - 14 Arney Road. A new stormwater pipeline will be installed through No. 13 Ranui Station Road to the rear of No. 14 Ranui Station Road. The size of the pipeline is 300 mm diameter with a length of 150 meters. The works will be carried out by open cut methods.

## TENDERS RECEIVED

Tenders were publicly advertised with seven sets of documents being uplifted. Five tenders were received by the closing date of 1 October 2002. These are summarised in Table 1 below:

TENDERER	REG OFFICE	TENDER PRICE (excl. GST)
RO Norman Contractors Limited	PO Box 300327, Albany	\$105,164.09
Counce Consultants NZ Ltd	722 Mt Eden Road, Mt Eden	\$128,822.00
Flowerday Enterprises Ltd	202 Findlay Road, Pukekohe	\$132,048.00
H & H Contractors Ltd	PO Box 15 084, New Lynn	\$150,430.00
Civil Construction Group Ltd	PO Box 46 009, Herne Bay	\$178,289.00
<b>Pre-tender contract estimate</b>		\$152,000.00

**Table 1 - Summary of Tender Prices**

## TENDER EVALUATION

In accordance with the conditions of tendering, tenders were evaluated in line with the Weighted Attribute Method contained in Transfund New Zealand's "Competitive Pricing Procedures Manual".

The "Two envelope process" as described in Section 2.7 of the above manual was followed. Under this method, only the first tender envelope is opened and the non-price attributes evaluated for all tenders before the second envelope containing the tender price is opened, and the tender prices duly included in the evaluation.

The tender of RO Norman Contractors Limited included an arithmetic error. When they were contacted to confirm the tender price, they advised in writing that they were unable to, and withdrew their tender. Therefore, the tender from RO Norman Contractors Limited was not considered further.

A summary of the evaluation results is shown in Table 2:

Tender Evaluation	Attributes	Exper.	Track Record	Tech. Skill	Resour.	Manag. Skill	Method.	Price	Contract Number EW02 646C	
		Weights	5	5	5	5	5	5	70	Total Weights
<b>Tenderer</b>	<b>Tender Sum</b>	<b>Grades</b>							<b>INDEX</b>	
RO Norman Contractors Limited	Withdrawn	75	80	65	75	55	50		Withdrawn	
Counce Consultants NZ Limited	\$128,822.00	50	40	50	40	40	50	59	55	
Flowerday Enterprises Limited	\$132,048.00	80	70	65	65	60	55	57	59	
H & H Contractors Limited	\$150,430.00	55	40	50	55	40	65	43	46	
Civil Construction Group Ltd	\$178,289.00	60	50	60	55	55	50	24	33	
<b>Median Tender Price</b>	<b>\$141,239.00</b>									

**Table 2 - Summary of Tender Evaluation**

The evaluation of the non-price attributes was based on the information provided in the tenders and on previous experience with the contractors.

The tender submitted by Counce Consultants NZ Limited becomes the lowest in price after the withdrawal of the RO Norman Contractors Limited tender. Counce Consultants NZ Limited submitted the required information in its tender for all the non-price attributes. However, independent referees contacted by Council regarded Counce Consultants NZ Limited as lacking in management skills. Furthermore, the Council's own experience with Counce Consultants NZ Limited has not been favourable, with problems due to the contractor's poor management skills leading to delays in construction programmes. Therefore, Counce Consultants NZ Limited was scored low in both the track record and management skill attributes.

Flowerday Enterprises Limited is an established drainage contractor who has been operating for over ten years and has completed many drainage projects successfully in the past including projects for Waitakere City Council. The firm was well regarded by all of their referees.

#### **TAGS, ERRORS OR OMISSIONS**

The tender submitted by RO Norman Contractors Limited contained an arithmetic error as discussed above. There were no tags, errors or omissions in any of the other tenders.

#### **CREDIT CHECK**

A credit check dated 1 November 2002 on Flowerday Enterprises Limited revealed no adverse information.

#### **SUMMARY**

The results of the tender evaluation as summarised in Table 2 show that the tender submitted by Flowerday Enterprise Limited achieved the highest overall index of 61. This tender is the second lowest priced tender.

Flowerday Enterprises Limited is considered to have the resources and capability to carry out this contract satisfactorily.

As part of City Services vision "Quality and Health and Safety is not negotiable" all contractors have had this focus clearly reinforced through the contract documents and this will be strongly reiterated at the subsequent pre-start meeting and imposed during the contract period.

#### **JOB COSTS**

	<b><u>EXCL. GST</u></b>
Tender sum - Flowerday Enterprises Limited	\$132,048.00
Contingency	\$ 13,205.00
Engineering & Supervision	\$ 3,747.00
	-----
Total Job Cost	\$149,000.00

**SOURCE OF FUNDING**

Project	Budget Description (from Annual Budget line item)	Codes	Budget	Committed to Other Projects	Allocation to This Project	Unallocated Balance
Willerton Road SW	Stormwater Upgrades Carryovers	85-9815-60000-999	\$3,266,685	\$1,957,172	\$42,870	\$1,266,643
Airdrie Road SW	Stormwater Upgrades Carryovers	85-9815-60000-999	\$3,266,685	\$2,000,042	\$39,098	\$1,227,545
Ranui Station Rd SW	Stormwater Upgrades Carryovers	85-9815-60000-999	\$3,266,685	\$2,039,140	\$67,032	\$1,160,513

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

1. That the information be received.
2. That the tender from Flowerday Enterprises Limited for Contract No. EW02 646C - Willerton Avenue, Airdrie Road and Ranui Station Road Stormwater Project in the sum of \$132,048.00 plus \$16,506.00 GST, totalling \$148,554.00 be accepted.
3. That the tender for Contract No. EW02 646C - Willerton Avenue, Airdrie Road and Ranui Station Road Stormwater Project be awarded to other than the lowest priced tender, because the weighted attributes tender evaluation method requires the tendering authority to enter into a contract only with the tender that scores the highest overall index.
4. That authority to enter into Contract No. EW02 646C - Willerton Avenue, Airdrie Road and Ranui Station Road Stormwater Project on behalf of Council be delegated to the Manager, EcoWater Solutions.

Report prepared by: Tony Miguel, Manager, EcoWater Solutions.

